

Exhibit A

Home

PACER

Help

General Docket

US Court of Appeals for the Third Circuit

Court of Appeals Docket #: 05-5445
12/20/05

Filed:

Nsuit: 3791 Labor: E.R.I.S.A.

Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

Appeal from: Eastern District of Pennsylvania

Lower court information:

District: 0313-2 : 04-cv-06097

Trial Judge: Legrome D. Davis, District Judge

Date Filed: 12/30/04

Date order/judgment: 11/22/05

Date NOA filed: 12/16/05

Fee status: paid

Prior cases:

None

Current cases:

None

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm

Page 1

05-5445 Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

SANDRA REGISTER
Appellant

Bryan L. Clobes
FAX 215-864-2810
215-864-2800

[COR NTC ret]
Michael S. Tarringer
215-864-2800
[COR NTC ret]
Miller, Faucher and Cafferty
18th & Cherry Streets
One Logan Square, 17th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19103

David H. Weinstein
FAX 215-545-6535
215-545-7200
[COR NTC ret]
Andrea L. Wilson
FAX 215-545-6535
215-545-7200
[COR NTC ret]
Weinstein, Kitchenoff & Asher
1845 Walnut Street
Suite 1100
Philadelphia, PA 19103

GRACE B. MERCHANT
Appellant

Bryan L. Clobes
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Michael S. Tarringer
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

David H. Weinstein
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Andrea L. Wilson
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

SUSAN L. WILSON
Appellant

Bryan L. Clobes
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Michael S. Tarringer
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

David H. Weinstein
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Andrea L. Wilson
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

KRISTINA BECKMAN

Bryan L. Clobes

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm

Page 2

05-5445 Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

Appellant

(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Michael S. Tarringer
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

David H. Weinstein
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Andrea L. Wilson
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

JOHN J. DAGGETT
Appellant

Bryan L. Clobes
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Michael S. Tarringer
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

David H. Weinstein
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Andrea L. Wilson
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

RICHARD RHOADES, ON BEHALF OF
THEMSELVES AND ALL OTHERS
SIMILARLY SITUATED
Appellant

Bryan L. Clobes
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Michael S. Tarringer
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

David H. Weinstein
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Andrea L. Wilson
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

v.

PNC FIN SER GRP INC
Appellee

William A. Slaughter
FAX 215-864-9788
215-864-8114
[COR NTC ret]
Arthur Makadon
FAX 215-864-9760
215-864-8200
[COR NTC ret]
Alan J. Davis
FAX 215-864-9516

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm

Page 3

05-5445 Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

215-864-8230
[COR NTC ret]
Ballard, Spahr, Andrews &
Ingersoll
1735 Market Street
51st Floor

Philadelphia, PA 19103

PNC BANK NA
Appellee

William A. Slaughter
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Arthur Makadon
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Alan J. Davis
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

PENSION COMMITTEE OF PNC
FINANCIAL SERVICES GROUP, INC.
PENSION PLAN
Appellee

William A. Slaughter
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Arthur Makadon
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Alan J. Davis
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

PNC FINANCIAL SERVICES GROUP,
INC. PENSION PLAN
Appellee

William A. Slaughter
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Arthur Makadon
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]
Alan J. Davis
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

AMERICAN ASSOCIATION OF
RETIRED PERSONS
Amicus-appellant

Jay E. Sushelsky
FAX 202-434-6424
202-434-2060
[COR NTC ret]
American Association of Retired
Persons
601 E Street, N.W.
Washington, DC 20049

EQUAL EMPLOYMENT ADVISORY
COUNCIL
Amicus-appellee

Ann E. Reesman
FAX 789-1708
202-789-8600
[COR NTC ret]

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm

Page 4

05-5445 Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

McGuinness, Norris & Williams
1015 15th Street, N.W.
Suite 1200
Washington, DC 20005

CHAMBER COMMERCE US
Amicus-appellee

Ann E. Reesman
(See above)
[COR NTC ret]

ERISA IND COMM
Amicus-appellee

Jeffrey G. Huvelle
202-662-5526
[COR NTC ret]
Covington & Burling
1201 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.
Washington, DC 20004

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm

Page 5

05-5445 Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

SANDRA REGISTER; GRACE B. MERCHANT;
SUSAN L. WILSON; KRISTINA BECKMAN;
JOHN J. DAGGETT; RICHARD RHOADES,
ON BEHALF OF THEMSELVES AND ALL

OTHERS SIMILARLY SITUATED,

Appellants

v.

PNC FINANCIAL SERVICES GROUP, INC.;
PNC BANK, N.A.;
PENSION COMMITTEE OF PNC FINANCIAL
SERVICES GROUP, INC. PENSION PLAN;
PNC FINANCIAL SERVICES GROUP, INC.
PENSION PLAN

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm

Page 6

05-5445 Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

12/20/05 CIVIL CASE DOCKETED. Notice filed by Sandra
Register,
Grace B. Merchant, Susan L. Wilson, Kristina
Beckman, John
J. Daggett, and Richard Rhoades. (tmk)

12/29/05 TRANSCRIPT PURCHASE ORDER (Part I), unnecessary for
appeal
purposes, filed. (tmk)

12/29/05 APPEARANCE from Attorneys Michael S. Tarringer, and
Bryan
L. Clobes on behalf of Appellants Sandra Register,
Grace B.
Merchant, Susan L. Wilson, Kristina Beckman, John J.
Daggett, and Richard Rhoades, filed. (tmk)

12/29/05 INFORMATION STATEMENT on behalf of Appellants Sandra
Register, Grace B. Merchant, Susan L. Wilson,
Kristina

Beckman, John J. Daggett, and Richard Rhoades,
received.
(tmk)

12/29/05
Sandra
Register, Grace B. Merchant, Susan L. Wilson,
Kristina
Beckman, John J. Daggett, and Richard Rhoades,
received.
(tmk)

12/29/05
Sandra
Register, Grace B. Merchant, Susan L. Wilson,
Kristina
Beckman, John J. Daggett, and Richard Rhoades,
filed. (tmk)

12/29/05
Ser Grp
Inc, PNC Bank NA, Pension Comm PNC Fin, and PNC Fin
Ser Grp
Inc, filed. (tmk)

12/30/05
behalf of
L.
Richard
APPEARANCE from Attorney David H. Weinstein on
Appellants Sandra Register, Grace B. Merchant, Susan
Wilson, Kristina Beckman, John J. Daggett, and
Rhoades, filed. (tmk)

12/30/05
Arthur
PNC
filed.
(tmk)
APPEARANCE from Attorneys William A. Slaughter, and
Makadon on behalf of Appellees PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc,
Bank NA, Pension Comm PNC Fin, and PNC Ser Grp Inc,

12/30/05
of
Appellants Sandra Register, Grace B. Merchant, Susan

L.
Richard
Wilson, Kristina Beckman, John J. Daggett, and
Rhoades, filed. (tmk)

1/4/06
CERTIFIED LIST filed. (tmk)

1/20/06
due
BRIEFING NOTICE ISSUED. Appellant brief and appendix
3/1/06. (tmk)

3/1/06
Pages:
ELECTRONIC BRIEF on behalf of Appellants, Copies: 1,
60, Word Count: 13,956, delivered by mail, filed.
Certificate of service date 3/1/06. (eh)

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm

Page 7

05-5445 Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

3/1/06
Volumes: 2
APPENDIX on behalf of Appellants, Copies: 4,
(Vol. 1 attached to brief), Delivered by Mail, filed.
Certificate of service date 3/1/06. (eh)

3/2/06
Grace
J.
Daggett and Richard Rhoades submitting 10 ccs of
brief with
Vol 1 of appendix attached. (eh)

3/10/06
MOTION by Proposed Amicus-Appellant AARP for leave to
proceed as amicus curiae, filed. Answer due 3/24/06.
Certificate of Service dated 3/9/06. (mcw)

3/23/06
ORDER (Nygaard, Authoring Judge) granting motion by

AARP
Appellants,
for leave to file amicus brief in support of
filed. C-81 (mcw)

3/23/06
Appellant AARP,
ELECTRONIC AMICUS BRIEF on behalf of Amicus-
Copies: 1, Pages: 32, Word Count: 6,974, delivered
by mail,
filed. Certificate of service date 3/9/06. (mcw)

3/23/06
Appellant
HARD COPY RECEIVED of amicus brief from Amicus-
AARP, Copies: 10. (mcw)

3/30/06
word
MOTION by Appellees to file a brief in excess of the
limitations set forth in FRAP 32 (15,000 words),
filed.
Answer due 4/14/06. Certificate of Service dated
3/30/06.
(gpk)

3/30/06
of
APPEARANCE from Attorney Jay E. Sushelsky on behalf
of Amicus-appellant AARP, filed. (tmk)

3/30/06
AARP,
DISCLOSURE STATEMENT on behalf of Amicus-appellant
filed. (tmk)

4/3/06
to
ORDER (Clerk) granting motion by Appellees for leave
to file overlength brief with filing as of the date of
this
order, filed. (gpk)

4/3/06
Pages:
ELECTRONIC BRIEF on behalf of Appellees. Copies: 1,
63, Word Count: 14,733 (Clk/O of 4/3/06), delivered
by
mail, filed. Certificate of service date 4/3/06.
(gpk)

4/3/06 RESPONSE by Appellants in Opposition to motion by
Appellees
to file brief in excess of word limitations set
forth in
FRAP 32, filed. Certificate of Service dated 4/3/06.
(gpk)

4/4/06 HARD COPY RECEIVED of brief from Appellees, Copies:
10. (mcw)

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm

Page 8

05-5445 Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

4/6/06 ORDER (Clerk) considering response by Appellants in
opposition to motion by Appellees to file brief in
excess
of word limitations. Pursuant to F.R.A.P. 27(b), "[t]
imely
opposition filed after the motion is granted in
whole or in
part does not constitute a request to reconsider,
vacate or
modify the disposition; a motion requesting that
relief
must be filed." The Clerk's Order of April 3, 2006,
will
remain in effect, filed. (gpk)

4/10/06 MOTION by Proposed Amicus-Appellees Equal Employ and
Chamber Commerce US for leave to proceed as amicus
curiae,
filed. Answer due 4/24/06. Certificate of Service
dated
4/7/06. (mcw)

4/14/06 MOTION by Proposed Amicus-Appellee ERISA Ind Comm

for leave

to proceed as amicus curiae, filed. Answer due

4/24/06.

Certificate of Service dated 4/11/06. (mcw)

4/20/06

ELECTRONIC REPLY BRIEF on behalf of Appellants.

Copies: 1.

Delivered by mail, filed. Certificate of service date 4/20/06. (gpk)

4/21/06

HARD COPY RECEIVED from Appellants (10cc of reply).

(gpk)

4/24/06

ORDER (Ambro, Authoring Judge) granting motion Equal

Employ

and Chamber Commerce US for leave to file brief as

amici

curiae in support of Appellees, filed. B-95 (mcw)

4/24/06

ELECTRONIC AMICUS BRIEF on behalf of Amicus-

Appellees Equal

Employ and Chamber Commerce US, Copies: 1, Pages: 19, delivered by mail, filed. Certificate of service date 4/7/06. (mcw)

4/24/06

HARD COPY RECEIVED of amicus brief from Amicus-

Appellees

Equal Employ and Chamber Commerce US, Copies: 10.

(mcw)

4/24/06

ORDER (Ambro, Authoring Judge) granting motion by

ERISA Ind

Comm for leave to file brief as amici curiae in

support of

Appellees is granted, filed. B-100 (mcw)

4/24/06

ELECTRONIC AMICUS BRIEF on behalf of Amicus-Appellee

ERISA

Ind Comm, Copies: 1, Pages: 31, Word Count: 6,945, delivered by mail, filed. Certificate of service date 4/11/06. (mcw)

4/24/06

HARD COPY RECEIVED of amicus brief from Amicus-

Appellee

ERISA Ind Comm, Copies: 10. (mcw)

4/24/06

APPEARANCE from Attorney Ann E. Reesman on behalf of Amicus-appellee Equal Employ, and Amicus-appellee

Chamber

Commerce US, filed. (tmk)

5/3/06

APPEARANCE from Attorney Jeffrey G. Huvelle on

behalf of

Amicus-appellee ERISA Ind Comm, filed. (tmk)

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm

Page 9

05-5445 Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

5/3/06

DISCLOSURE STATEMENT on behalf of Amicus-appellee

ERISA Ind

Comm, filed. (tmk)

8/9/06

LETTER dated 8/9/06 filed pursuant to Rule 28(j) from counsel for Appellee, filed. ZZ#SEND ZZ#TO ZZ#MERITS ZZ#PANEL (tmk)

9/14/06

LETTER dated 9/14/06 pursuant to Rule 28(j) from

counsel

for Appellants, filed. ZZ#SEND ZZ#TO ZZ#MERITS

ZZ#PANEL (tmk)

9/22/06

LETTER dated 9/22/06 filed pursuant to Rule 28(j)

from

counsel for Appellee, filed. ZZ#SEND ZZ#TO ZZ#MERITS ZZ#PANEL (tmk)

9/26/06

CALENDARED for Thursday, December 14, 2006. (clr)

11/7/06

LETTER dated 11/7/06 filed pursuant to Rule 28(j)

from

counsel for Appellants, filed. ZZ#SEND ZZ#TO
ZZ#MERITS
ZZ#PANEL (tmk)

11/22/06 APPEARANCE from Attorney Alan J. Davis on behalf of
Appellees PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, PNC Bank NA, Pension
Comm
PNC Fin and PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, filed. (tmk)

11/30/06 LETTER dated 11/30/06 filed pursuant to Rule 28(j)
from
counsel for Appellees, filed. ZZ#SEND ZZ#TO ZZ#MERITS
ZZ#PANEL (tmk)

12/13/06 LETTER by Appellants dated 12/13/06 pursuant to Rule
28(j),
filed. ZZ#SEND ZZ#TO ZZ#MERITS ZZ#PANEL (tmk)

12/14/06 ARGUED Thursday, December 14, 2006 Panel: Fisher,
Chagares
and Greenberg, Circuit Judges. Counsel for
Appellants:
David H. Weinstein and Counsel for Appellees: Alan J.
Davis. (eh)

12/29/06 LETTER dated 12/29/06 filed pursuant to Rule 28(j)
from
counsel for Appellant, filed. ZZ#SEND ZZ#TO ZZ#MERITS
ZZ#PANEL (tmk)

1/17/07 LETTER dated 1/17/07 filed pursuant to Rule 28(j)
from
counsel for Appellees, filed. ZZ#SEND ZZ#TO ZZ#MERITS
ZZ#PANEL (tmk)

1/29/07 LETTER dated 1/29/07 filed pursuant to Rule 28(j)
from
counsel for Appellees, filed. ZZ#SEND ZZ#TO ZZ#MERITS
ZZ#PANEL (tmk)

1/30/07 PRECEDENTIAL OPINION (Fisher, Chagares and Greenberg,
Authoring Judge, Circuit Judges), filed. (tmk)

1/30/07 JUDGMENT AFFIRMED. Costs taxed against Appellants,
filed.
(tmk)

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm Page 10

05-5445 Register, et al v. PNC Fin Ser Grp Inc, et al

2/13/07 PETITION by Appellant for rehearing en banc, filed.
Certificate of service dated 2/13/07. (tmk)

Docket as of February 15, 2007 6:14 pm Page 11

PACER Service Center			
Transaction Receipt			
02/23/2007 09:28:24			
PACER Login:	ct0365	Client Code:	
Description:	dktrpt	Case Number:	05-5445
Billable Pages:	11	Cost:	0.88
